

Taylor JS: Stakes and Kidneys. Why Markets in Human Body Parts are Morally Imperative. Series: Live Questions in Ethics and Moral Philosophy. Hampshire: Ashgate; 2005. 226 pages; ISBN: 0 7546 4110 4; Price: US\$29.95/£16.99

Field: Medical Ethics and Moral Philosophy

Audience: Ethicists, physicians, medical historians, medical students, lawyers

Purpose: To bring forward arguments in favor of kidney markets.

Content: James Stacy Taylor argues that current methods of organ procurement should be regulated by legal market for human transplant organs purchased from live vendors. Furthermore, the author pays particular attention to outlining the implications that recognizing the moral legitimacy of these market transactions in human body parts and reproductive capacities have for public policy.

The content is divided into 9 chapters: The Problem – and Some Proposed Solutions; Dworkin on Autonomy; Fear and Kidney Sales; Is the Typical Kidney Vendor Forced to Sell?; Constraining Options and Kidney Markets; A Moral Case for Market Regulation; Kidney Sales and Dangerous Employment; Human Dignity and the Fear of Commodification; and Commodification, Altruism and Kidney Procurement. It ends with concluding remarks, extensive bibliography, and an index. Taylor's arguments for the establishment of regulated markets in human body parts are based on the values of human well-being and respect for autonomy. He actually deals with the central objections to commercial human organ sales and finds them wanting, showing that organ sale enhances the dignity of those who sell. His argumentation for legalization of regulated organ market is based on the belief that legal market would drive down the de-

mand for black market organs as the legal brokers would offer a safer product. On the other hand, it would also provide states in which the black market is prevalent with an incentive to eliminate it. On this basis, he rejects the concern that legalizing organ market would encourage murder and organ theft.

Highlights: To add and/or challenge views on organ markets and to present arguments why such markets are morally imperative. This book certainly is a welcome event for those in favor of human organ sales and a genuine challenge for the opponents of such markets. Medicine is already in the business of pushing the boundaries in the complex area which consists of balancing between benefit of patients, economy, and limits of technology and knowledge. How the hypothetical legalized organ market would be reflected on the altruism and motivation of medical practitioners involved in the process of organ transplantation is not an easy question. The literature already draws attention to considerably large number of medical professionals who for ethical reasons reject to participate in small operations such as circumcision without strict medical indication. It is to be expected then, that taking organs from healthy individuals, exposing them to operation risk and possible complications, within the legalized organ market, would raise even more ethical doubts. Therefore, a simple solution to shortage of organs that Taylor proposes is perhaps simple in theory, while in practice it seems to be a very complex issue, particularly when medical procedure and the role and com-

petence of professionals is concerned. *Stakes and Kidneys* is a provocative book that certainly will shape further the debate regarding human organ markets.

Related reading: The science and art of medicine are practiced within the framework of a societal value system which has legal, religious, ethical, and other parameters that intersect with health care, decision making, and action. The discipline of medical ethics has undergone steady elaboration in recent years, which has been reflected within faculty of medical schools

by launching journal centers for medical ethics. There is a variety of works dedicated to clarifying the changing relations between medicine and the critical value areas. Useful overview and collection of essays on organ transplants was edited through *Ethical Eye* series by the Council of Europe, while different aspects on this issue can also be read through papers published in the *International Journal of Applied Philosophy*.

Stella Fatović-Ferenčić

stella@hazu.hr